

The Trouble with Attribution

Travis Farral

Director of Security Strategy at Anomali

February 16, 2017

Sometimes cited for attribution...

- Non-English keyboard language
- Non-English strings in malware or non-English comments in scripts
- Use of The Onion Router (TOR) to anonymize network traffic
- Use of Virtual Private Servers (VPS) from a “shady” provider
- Use of a Virtual Private Network (VPN) provider that has been used in other attacks associated to particular actor or group
- Use of a foreign free webmail provider
 - Such as: QQ Mail, Yandex, or Mail.ru

Extra credit

- Use of Mimikatz or other widely available tools
- Use of PowerShell during exploitation or lateral movement
 - Such as the Empire framework (www.powershell-empire.com)
- Use of URL shortening services such as Bit.ly to obfuscate malicious links
- Use of techniques such as fake landing pages for services like Gmail, Hotmail, or Yahoo mail
- Activities performed during business hours in Moscow or Beijing

What is attribution typically based on?

- A collection of mostly circumstantial evidence
 - Example: Russian keyboard, Russian comments, Russian timezone
- Overlap with tools and infrastructure used in other incidents
 - Particularly for tools only known to be associated to a single actor or group
- Actors aligned with motivations for the attack
- Non-public evidence from other collection sources
 - Forensic evidence
 - Subpoenaed evidence
 - Government sources and methods

Better for attribution

- Specialized tools only associated with a specific group
 - Source code unavailable outside the group
- Computer names
- SSH keys
- Use of very specific, non-publicly known techniques
 - The same **unique** account names, scripts, service names, etc.
- Infrastructure only known to be controlled by a single group
- Use of specific email addresses
 - For communication or DNS registration, etc.

What is *really* known?

- Is it *really attribution* to a specific actor or group?
- Or is it more “this attack bears similarities to this other attack”?
 - Neither of which may actually point to a specific actor
- “Motivations for this attack align with the possible goals of _____”
- True attribution strength may lie in non-public details
 - It's a matter of faith in the institution delivering the attribution

In the end...

What does attribution do for me anyway?

How valuable is attribution?

- If you aren't using it as the basis for foreign policy decisions . . .
 - Nations have different reasons for leveraging attribution than companies
- Some considerations for attribution:
 - Know what an adversary is after
 - Useful towards counterintelligence
 - Aids predictive intelligence
- Otherwise . . .
 - Simply knowing as much as possible about observed attacks aids defense
 - Techniques used, tools used, infrastructure used, targeted users or infrastructure



Thank you!

Travis Farral

- travis@anomali.com
- [@mivyx](#)
- [Linkedin.com/in/travisfarral](https://www.linkedin.com/in/travisfarral)
- [Github.com/mivyx](https://github.com/mivyx)

- For more on attribution:
 - www.anomali.com/election